

MINUTES  
**Hamilton Historic District Commission / Historical Commission**  
October 11, 2018

Members Present: Edwin Howard, Chair, Elizabeth Wheaton, Stefani Serafini  
Katherine Mittelbush, Kristen Weiss, Margaret Meahl and Scott Clements.

Staff Present: Dorr Fox

---

Ed Howard opened the meeting and public hearing at 6:05 p.m.

**624 BAY ROAD**

Mr. Howard opened the public hearing at 6:06 p.m. noting that it would focus on the replacement of the roof from wood shingles to asphalt shingles. He stated that at the last meeting they had asked Dorr Fox to talk with the Massachusetts Historical Commission and other preservation organizations to find out how other communities handle this issue.

Mr. Fox stated he had contacted the Massachusetts Historical Commission. They suggested that he review the preservation listserv. Entries on the listserv revealed that Somerville and Brookline allowed applicants to replace wood roofs with asphalt. He also contacted Preservation Massachusetts staff, who recommended that he speak with the Salem preservation staff because they have dealt with this issue. He noted that Salem's guidelines did not recommend using architectural shingles, other than for Victorian structures. However, they are re-thinking this issue. Salem also prefers that the roof shingles be darker, in an effort to make them less visible. He also spoke to the preservation planner on Cape Cod, who noted that the present day quality of wood shingles is lower than in the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century. If the applicant replaced their roof with wood, it would not last as long as it would have previously. She also noted that the roof at 624 Bay Road has a shallow slope and is not prominent in comparison with other structures, which would indicate that it might not be as visible as other roofs. He also reviewed guidelines for other communities. Most other communities do not address this roof issue.

Mr. Howard stated that establishing guidelines would be a priority in the future. He noted that a point that was made in the Historic New England documents was that roofs are temporary protection for the building. He also noted that one of the guidelines recommended against architectural shingles because they drew attention to themselves. He also noted that Jack Hauck had stated that the roof was not that visible.

Elizabeth Wheaton and Stefani Serafini noted that the roof is visible. There was a brief discussion regarding the visibility of the roof.

Ms. Wheaton inquired whether there was a new application. Mr. Fox stated that they just had submitted the one page application, however, they are bringing samples of what they wish to use.

Ms. Serafini noted that she cannot vote on the project since she was noticed as a property owner within 300 feet of the site.

Scott Johnson, representing the Congregational Church, stated that they are looking for the roof to fit into the district. He believes that the roof samples that they brought fit into the neighborhood and are similar to the roof on other buildings in the district.

Mr. Howard stated that he likes the reddish brown roof on the adjacent structure. He would not support the concept of replacing the subject roof with wood shingles.

Mr. Johnson showed five samples in the Landmark series. He noted that they show variations of black and gray. He noted that at the previous meeting there seemed to be a preference for less texture. He stated that they are proposing the shingle titled 'Weathered Wood.' He believes that this is in keeping with color of the existing roof.

Scott Clements noted that it will look different higher up and in daylight. Ms. Wheaton noted that some of the samples call attention to themselves. She noted that the information that they read stated that they should be aware that architectural shingles and lighter colors draw attention to themselves as not being authentic. She asked about the metal flashing and inquired whether it would be kept. Mr. Johnson stated that this is not currently done. The roof would be shingled to the edge of the roof. The wood gutters will be retained.

Margaret Meahl inquired about the age of the existing roof. Mr. Johnson stated that it is between thirty and fifty years old.

Ms. Serafini noted that there are three different roofs on the structure. Mr. Johnson stated that all of the roofs are different.

Ms. Meahl inquired whether they had spoken to any of their neighbors about their roofs. If any of the neighbors had recently replaced their roof, had they inquired about what they had used. Mr. Johnson stated that they had not.

Kristen Weiss stated that she is not as concerned about using the architectural shingles. She believes the color of the shingles is more important. She is also concerned about the variation of color within the shingles. She believes that they are distracting. She has a more favorable opinion of the darker shingles that are more uniform in color. Mr. Johnson stated that they are inclined to use the Landmark series, which has less variation in color within the shingles. Ms. Weiss stated that the brown shingles tend to look lighter, which draws one's eyes to them. Ms. Wheaton stated that she would prefer to go in the direction of the darker shingles because the lighter shingles draw attention to themselves.

Mr. Johnson stated that the current historic wood roof has texture. Ms. Weiss stated that the Commission would be allowing a roof that is not historic and therefore would like it to be as appropriate as possible. Ms. Meahl inquired whether there

could be a different roof on the back side of the house. She then noted that this may not be appropriate.

Ms. Meahl noted that she liked the roof on Katherine Mittelbusher's house. Ms. Mittelbusher reviewed the samples and pointed out the color of the roof on her house. There was discussion among the Commission members about the samples and the catalogues and which color might be the most appropriate. They discussed the darkness of the shingles as well as the variation in color.

Ms. Wheaton noted that they could go with the traditional three tab shingles.

Mr. Johnson stated the names of four types of shingles in the Landmark series. He stated that he chose the group because he was trying to avoid a shocking change from the existing roof.

Ms. Meahl asked Mr. Johnson which roof style was his favorite. Mr. Johnson stated that he liked the 'Weathered Wood' style. Ms. Weiss stated that since they have determined that the new roof will not be wood, the historic material, the discussion changes. The concern would be that the roof would look like a fake version of a wood roof.

Mr. Johnson stated that they are concerned that the portion of the roof that is going to be replaced not be jarring in relation to the portion of the roof that is not being replaced. They are only replacing roof on the main portion of the building. He stated that the addition to the house has a rubber roof.

Ms. Serafini stated that she prefers the 'Weather Wood' style in the Landmark series.

It was noted that since the Commission was not forcing the Church to replace the roof with wood, it was best to determine which style was most appropriate and draws the least attention to itself. There was discussion regarding whether 'Charcoal Black' or 'Pewterwood' would be the most appropriate.

Ms. Wheaton stated that she prefers the 'Charcoal Black' style. Mr. Johnson stated that he believes that the black roof will increase the temperature within the building. He is also concerned that the black roof will be jarring in comparison to the roof on the other portion of the building. Ms. Mittelbusher stated that she thinks the 'Moire Black' will be more uniform than they are thinking. Mr. Clements stated that since the roof is higher than the addition to the building, he doesn't think the darker color will be jarring. He thinks that it is most important to make sure the new roof is compatible with the other surrounding buildings.

Ms. Mittelbusher stated that she believes that she has 'Moire Black' shingles on her house and that it does not have a lot of variation in color. She believes that 'Charcoal Black' shingles would not have any variation in color.

Ms. Weiss stated that 'Pewterwood' shingles may be darker than she had originally thought and is looking more acceptable to her. Mr. Clements noted that looking at a

catalogue does not always tell one what the shingles will actually look like once they are on a structure. He thinks that they should look at the samples and not the catalogues. Three Commission members stated that they liked the 'Pewterwood' shingles.

Mr. Howard made a motion to approve the roof replacement with 'Pewterwood' style shingles in the Landmark series. Ms. Meahl seconded the motion. Ms. Wheaton stated that she prefers the 'Charcoal Black' style of shingles. Four members voted in favor of the motion. Two members voted in opposition (Ms. Wheaton and Ms. Mittelbusher).

The public hearing was closed at 6:45 p.m.

#### 468 HIGHLAND STREET

Mr. Fox stated there is a question whether the partial demolition proposed at 468 Highland Street is under the jurisdiction of the Historical Commission. The bylaw states that demolitions greater than 50% are under the Commission's jurisdiction. Is this 50% of the footprint or floor area? Since there is a reference to architectural features, there is a question how this fits into the calculation.

The building is called Brick End Farm. Portions of the building were built in the 18<sup>th</sup>, 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. In addition, a portion of the building was moved from South Carolina.

Mr. Fox noted that there would be a site visit at 10:00 a.m. on October 17, 2018. Mr. Howard encouraged all of the members to attend. Mr. Fox noted that they propose to demolish a portion of the historic building and plan to replace 19<sup>th</sup> century windows on the 18<sup>th</sup> century portion of the building.

Several members of the Commission stated that they will attend. Mr. Fox stated that he will post the meeting.

#### OTHER BUSINESS

Mr. Howard stated that the Historic District Commission would like to have a meeting with the architect for the restoration of Town Hall. He would like to have Mr. Fox write a letter to the Town Hall Building Committee. The other members of the Commission concurred. Mr. Clements inquired about the jurisdiction of the Commission over landscaping. Ms. Wheaton stated that they can make suggestions to the designers regarding the landscape.

Mr. Howard stated that he has been interested in having the Town establish a kiosk so that municipal boards and committees can communicate to the public. There was discussion that the new temporary flashing sign at the Public Safety Building could take on this role. David Smith stated that the large illuminated sign is the most effective. He does not think people would stop to look at a wooden kiosk in the front of the Community House. Ms. Wheaton stated that if they wanted a kiosk that had

more detailed information, it would be best to locate it in front of Crosby's, since that is where people walk.

#### MINUTES

Ms. Wheaton made a motion to approve the minutes of the September 13, 2018 meeting. Ms. Weiss seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.

Ms. Meale made a motion adjourn the meeting at 7:10 p.m. Ms. Mittelbusher seconded the motion and it was unanimously approved.